

Dungeness River Management Team

APPROVED July 13, 2016 Meeting Notes

Prepared by Sam Brend, Clallam County

Team Members/ Alternates in Attendance

Cathy Lear, Clallam County (alt)
Shawn Hines, Jamestown S'Klallam Tribe (alt)
Robert Beebe, Riverside Property Owners
Donald Hatler, Sports Fisheries
Robert Phreaner, Audubon Society
Peter Walker, Audubon Society (alt)
Ann Soule, City of Sequim
David Garlington, City of Sequim (alt)
Judy Larson, Protecting the Peninsula's Future
Matt Heins, Estuary-tidelands/Riverside Prop. Owner
Marc McHenry, U.S. Forest Service

Others in Attendance

Sam Brend, Clallam County
Bill Strehle, Resident
Rebecca Benjamin, NOSC
Phil Martin, Resident
Juan Stockes, GM
Phil Lusk, Port Angeles Resident
Michael Blanton, WDFW

I. Introductions/ Review Agenda

- Robert Beebe chaired the meeting and called the meeting to order. Introductions were made. There was no quorum at the beginning so approving minutes was done at the end. 2015 Drought Lessons and Dungeness Smolt Update, Tribe Perspective will be postponed until next month.

Public Comment

- Phil Lusk, who is a Port Angeles resident, wrote a letter to the editor in the Sequim Gazette expressing his disappointment in PUD management and suggesting that all Clallam County residents should be interested in this initiative as it's a good deal for our county, good for climate change and a good mechanism to get a rebate for low-income people.
- Judy Larson expressed concerns about PUD. She said their recent newsletter put a positive spin on nuclear energy as a clean alternative and suggested it was accepted by the general population. But there are concerns with nuclear energy, given the earthquake hazards in the area. No documentation of where they got their sources to make such a blatant statement.
- Judy said the meeting presenting the draft proposal for weed control is happening now. New concerns about Round-Up were seen recently in Mother Earth News. She thought it important that information about this be presented to the DRMT before it goes to the commissioners because it is pertinent to our concerns about water quality.

II. Wild Wood Lane- Armoring Updates, A Cautionary Tale, Michael Blanton, WDFW

- Michael Blanton works primarily in North Kitsap County, Bainbridge Island but has also helped on the Dungeness.
- Michael explained a few caveats: some of the views he will express are his own opinions and may or not be the same as the state and he is not here to blame anyone. Just wants to give an example of where the system has let us down.

- This project was located at River Mile 8 at Wildwood Lane. This 2015 Fall and Winter saw multiple 5-year events right after each other.
- Then the December 9th and 10th event happened. Lost over 40 ft of bank in one night. The well head was 50 ft from river bank previous to losing it. The property owners, who were staying in their camper near the river woke up with the camper leaning over the bank. An emergency HPA had to be issued because there aren't many resources to use when it gets to that point. HPA to armor the shoreline to protect the wellhead and the not-yet-finished new residence. Michael said it is harder to mitigate for emergency requests to WDFW.
- Judy asked when the permit date was. Answer: 2010.
- There is now between 100 and 150 ft of armoring on part of the property; a second permit was also issued for more armoring. This location is just south of Dungeness Meadows and the existing Corp Dike.
- Michael showed all the tools the County uses to prevent something like this, including the Dungeness River Comprehensive Flood Hazard Management Plan Channel Meander Zone (CMZ) handbook. Looking at the CMZ, the residence is in an area at high risk for avulsion. Michael doesn't think the CMZ report was used when issuing the permit. The well has been in for a longer time and is considered a pre-existing structure. Showed old permits and aerial photos from '94, '13, '15.
- The owners then came back for another HPA to protect their property from behind because the river was eating away at the south end of the property.
- Q from Rebecca Benjamin- What do you propose? How do we overcome this? Michael– Raising awareness, let folks know we need to not let it happen.
- Judy- We got an update from Steve Grey (Clallam County) in May; if the new SMP doesn't address issues like this then it should be reevaluated. This information should be presented to the County and Planning Commission.
- Cathy Lear gave her opinion from the County perspective, suggesting that people are going to do what they want to do and fight with the County all the way. Cathy can give Steve and Mary Ellen a preview regarding the DRMT's concern with this issue before it gets brought up to the Planning Commission.

III. Initiative 732 – Mike Massa, CarbonWA

- Carbon WA is a grassroots organization that has been around for 6 or 7 years. It was formalized a few years ago. It is non-partisan and has over 30+ chapters in Washington. They have collected over 360,000 signatures so far.
- Policy Goals: Effective, Fair (protect low/mid income households, protect small businesses), support economic growth, politically viable and durable (draw support from both sides).
- This policy is modeled after the one instituted in BC in 2008. It is a revenue neutral policy. BC now has the lowest corporate and personal taxes in Canada. Want people earning money and creating economic growth, and don't want pollution. It did not kill the economy. It was put into place by a center-right government. Last year 61% of residents approved of it.
- Each fuel type gets taxed in regards to its emission level. Natural gas is taxed less than petroleum which is less than coal. \$25/ton carbon tax. The national average has more coal/gas than Washington State. Washington is more fossil intensive than BC. North West Power mix is considered 40% coal. BPA is 93% clean, 7% unspecified, which 1-732 would tax as coal. The amount is not published as to what constitutes the mix, but can assume that 40% is from a coal source. I-732 would prevent gaming the system and would force information to flow.
- Initiative puts a \$25/ton tax on all fossil fuel consumed in Washington State and on electricity imported into our state. Reduce sales tax by 1%, eliminate B&O tax on manufactures, fund and increase the working families rebate. How well you come out with this tax depends on how fuel intensive your life is.
- Public Q: How much weight of carbon is in a gallon of gas? A: – around .25 cents per gallon

- Public Q: Where will the money be spent? A:– Will go to general fund, 2.2 billion per year gain
- Tax cuts, money coming out of the general fund: 250 million for the rebate, 450 million for the B&O tax, 1.5 billion from sales tax cut, makes it revenue neutral. Slower phase in – ag diesel, non-profit transit. Will move up to \$100 per year over a 40 year period
- Q: Why give money back in the rebate? A: Energy taxes are regressive. The lowest income bracket pays 17% of their income on taxes, this policy will lower that percentage to 7%.
- Mike discussed differences in estimates of tax revenue from the Office of Financial Management (deficit) and their own estimates (net positive). He compared these numbers to the entire state budget and showed the insignificance of the estimates. Estimate from a state study suggest climate change will cost the state 3.8 billion dollars by 2020 (University of Oregon Study).
- Judy- Has the state or Washington done any research about health costs for reduction of pollution? – There have been a lot nationwide. Not at the state level.
- Clallam County residents will pay 200-300 more in carbon tax, but will pay 200-300 less in sales tax. The cost per year of electric heat in a 2,000 sq ft home is an extra \$40 per year. Whether you are ahead or behind will ultimately come from your transportation uses. Because the PUD fuel mix is so clean, people will most likely come out on the plus side.
- Carbon.cs.washington.edu – Revenue Neutral Carbon Tax Calculator
- Mike talked about the miscalculations that Clallam PUD presented at the last DRMT meeting. They only talked about the carbon tax, not sales tax cuts, didn't talk about climate change costs. Regarding the pancaking effect the PUD discussed, the Clean Power Plan is currently on hold, but taxing carbon is one compliance path for the state to use, the other is to put in a cap and trade system. The state's Draft Clean Air Rule exempts the electric sector from regulation and defers to the Clean Power Plan. Only imposes regulations if the Clean Power Plan is not in effect. I-937 requires utilities to buy an increasing amount of renewable power (wind, solar, small hydro) and requires them to increase by 15% by 2020. Predicated on the idea that demand was growing so new demand would be met with renewables instead of fossil. Demand hasn't been growing because of efficiencies, LEDs, heat pumps, insulation have kept demand flat even as population has grown. The utilities are still being asked to grow their renewables, so have to intentionally switch. If I-732 is successful it will decrease the amount of carbon and increase renewables (so not carbon taxed).
- Doesn't tax biomass, only fossil carbon. When carbon is taxed people are pushed to choose more electric vehicles and electric heat pumps and in doing that, it will help maintain the utilities load demand. The big solution to climate change is to electrify. The cost of solar and wind have been coming down dramatically.
- Public Q:- Have any healthcare groups come out in support? A: – Not yet.
- There is a split with environmental groups. Some want to keep the money made from the revenue and spend it on more environmental issues, others do not. Trying to build a coalition of the center.
- Judy- Have the gubernatorial candidates said anything positions-wise? – Not yet.
- Q- Don Hatler- Gasoline? This would be from the producer? The distributor would collect the tax... – It is applied as far upstream in the distribution change as possible. The importer and distributor pay the tax, not the gas station, not you at the pump. The seller of electricity is required to collect the tax, so that ends up being the citizen's utility. Very efficient policy, unlike one that tries to return the money via government programs. Or tries to measure the emissions from every individual power plant.
- First step forward, not the end all be all. We know it works, BC has done it. It would put the strongest price on carbon in North America at \$25 per ton to \$100 per ton (within 40 years). BC is sitting at \$22 US. Improves the fairness of the state tax system. Preserves manufacturing jobs. If it isn't working out, the policy can adjust to

changing market conditions. It is simple and explainable. It creates a model that other states and Congress and follow.

- Public- Concerned about lead contamination in rivers. Fishermen use weights and it sinks to the bottom.

IV. Other Business/ Public Comment

- With quorum now present, Matt Heins moved to approve last 4 months of meeting notes. Don Hatler seconded. Was approved.
- Rebecca Benjamin from NOSC gave an update on several projects. Three Crabs Restoration Project was started a few weeks ago. Have put the new roadbed in place. Had to preload the road with extra dirt to settle in; once it is settled in, will remove and put in road. Begun excavation of some of the upland along 3 crabs Road, 2 ½ - 3 acres that has been excavated, will recruit salt marsh vegetation over time. Have started digging on the tidal lagoons. Working on creosote clean up from old posts from a barn. \$50,000 job. Have taken all the concrete off site. Removed rip rap that was in front of 3 crabs restaurant. The bridge will not be taken out until the road is done and approved by the county and the old road is vacated by the county. Wrapped up sometime in October. Hired Interwest, have an office in Carlsborg.
- Anne- I've heard that it's becoming more in favor to recycle materials when tearing up roads.
- Matt- Concrete was recycled they used as much as they could once it was crushed up. And don't know if they'll use the asphalt from the old road. They'll take it somewhere, they crush it up and sell it back out. Washington State allows some of that recycled asphalt to go back into new asphalt. They limit it because of the burn off when they heat up the rock.
- Judy- The Port has decided not to do anything yet regarding the piers? – Correct.
- Rebecca said they are in the midst of the project in Sequim Bay at the Dawley Shoreline Site, just east of Sequim Bay State Park. Was gifted by the Dawley family to US Fish and Wildlife Service and is the first gnarly interruption in nice migration corridor for the fish leaving Jimmycomelately. Have removed some piers there and overwater structure and cabin. Will get in and start doing in-water work and restore shorelines. Pitship Pocket- no more funding to monitor site.
- Shawn- There will be a field trip to that site (the Dawley Shoreline Restoration site on Sequim Bay) on October 12th and a viewing of the film, The Breach, on the same day. The producer will come and speak. September 14th will also be a field trip, to visit the 3 crabs project site and Towne Road and possibly Hurd Creek Hatchery.
- Cathy Lear showed a video of a drone flying the sections of the Dungeness which will be/ have been worked on regarding the levy removal. Want to start documenting now so they can see changes over time. Chris Enges was the videographer from Spirit Vision Films.
- Robert Phreaner- To a follow-up on 1-732 he wanted to read a letter showing Audubon Washington's support for the Initiative. Letter is incorporated in minutes. Attached here. Asked for a motion for the DRMT to support or consider supporting 1-732 and vote in September?
- Judy said the DRMT has endorsed legislation before. Ann Soule said they probably need members to get permission from their organizations. Judy suggested DRMT see if the DRMT by-laws say anything regarding this. Shawn said DRMT discussed endorsement of a house bill recently, but never formally decided since the bill ended up being dropped.
- Robert amended motion for member organizations to support the initiative. Judy will present to her group. Don would personally support and would chat with the board of the Conservation District.
- Mike Doherty talked about his support for I-732. Democratic Party will have people leafleting in target areas. Hopes people support the initiative.